

The European Union and Member State  
Territories: A New Legal Framework Under  
the EU Treaties

Fiona Murray

The European Union and  
Member State Territories:  
A New Legal Framework  
Under the EU Treaties

T · M · C · A S S E R P R E S S

 Springer

Dr. Fiona Murray  
Rue de la Poste 214  
1030 Brussels  
Belgium  
e-mail: fiona@schumanassociates.com

ISBN 978-90-6704-825-5

e-ISBN 978-90-6704-826-2

DOI 10.1007/978-90-6704-826-2

Library of Congress Control Number: 2011945152

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands, and the author 2012

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands <http://www.asserpress.nl>

Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

*Cover design:* eStudio Calamar S.L.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

*For my husband, Barry O'Halpin*

# Foreword

Dr. Fiona Murray's book on *The European Union and Member State Territories* should be praised as a major contribution in the English language literature to an important topic which had been almost only covered until 2011 by literature in French or Spanish. It is worthwhile quoting the preface that has been written for the only other English language book dealing with this topic (Dimitry Kochenov, *EU Law of the Overseas*, 2011) by the Honourable Sir Richard Plender, Justice of the High Court of England and Wales, to which he was appointed in 2007, as it also applies to Dr. Murray's work:

“The study of European Union (EU) law has become too Eurocentric. Essays on inter-personal and commercial exchanges within the EU abound, but rarely do they consider the impact of the Union's laws in non-European territories. Even the treaty-making capacity of the Union is more frequently examined from a constitutional than from an international perspective. This is much to the disadvantage of those who have to address the EU's external impact: a disadvantage that I experienced at first hand, when required to deal with the status of the Faeroe Islands [...] and in my years as legal adviser to the States (parliament) of the Bailiwick of Jersey”.

Differently from Kochenov's book, which is a collection of essays by some twenty leading experts—mainly academics—Dr. Murray's book is the work of a single author, who researched her topic with passion during the years which led to her being awarded the grade of Ph.D at the Erasmus university, Rotterdam. The book is proposing a thesis, namely that the clauses of the EU treaties dealing with the differentiated statuses of Member States' Territories which are not part of mainland Europe or the British Isles (Channel Islands and Isle of Man excepted) are not adapted to the present and future situation and should be redrafted. Arguing a thesis does not necessarily mean developing abstract reasoning: on the contrary, Dr. Murray's book is firmly rooted in reality.

The major contribution of Dr. Murray's book, which should open it a large readership, is the extremely precise and detailed study of the different EU Member States' Territories which enjoy a differentiated status: European territories for whose external relations a Member State is responsible, EU outermost regions which are non-European territories forming part of France, Portugal and Spain,

and the overseas countries and territories associated with the union, which are non-European territories constitutionally bound to Denmark, France, the Netherlands, or the United Kingdom.

Far from being a dull legal work, Dr. Murray's book is therefore also an invitation to travel around the world, which the reader will certainly enjoy.

Jacques Ziller, Ph.D.

Professor of EU law at the University of Pavia, formerly professor at the European University Institute (Florence), at Sorbonne University (Paris) and at the University of the French West Indies and Guyana

# Preface

During the 20 years I have been working in the area of EU law and policy, a considerable part of this experience has been devoted to advising and assisting EU Member State territories, both Governments and private sector. In working with these territories from an EU perspective, a number of factors have struck me, notably:

- The disparate nature of their relationships with the EU; whilst some territories chose to join the EU, others opted to remain outside; all, however, had negotiated derogations or special arrangements from the TEC
- The absence of any coherent overall EU policy in relation to these territories, despite their many broad similarities
- The piecemeal nature of their evolution *vis à vis* the EU.

In general, in my work for these territories, it was not always easy to find source materials that would, for example, clarify the precise nature of their legal relations with the EU or facilitate comparisons between territories or groups of territories in the context of the EU.

It was in order to address the dearth of source materials on EU Member State Territories as a whole that I wrote and published a book in 2004 on “*EU and Member State Territories: The Special Relationship under Community Law*”.<sup>1</sup> The then European Commissioner for Development, Poul Nielsen acknowledged in a foreword to the book the “information deficit” on the subject.

Having written what was intended to be a straightforward reference book about the territories, I then began to consider the Treaty’s basic legal framework for relations between Member State Territories and the EU as set out (until the recent entry into force of the Lisbon Treaty) in Article 299 TEC. Once I had reviewed the individual relations with the EU particularly in the context of their evolution since 1957, I observed that Article 299 seemed somewhat incongruous as a broad legal framework for relations between Member States Territories and the EU, due

---

<sup>1</sup> Murray 2004.

particularly to the many developments that had taken place since the TEC was signed in 1957 which no longer seemed to fit appropriately into the current Article 299 framework. Therefore, I decided to investigate further:

- The origins of Article 299 as a legal framework for relations between the EU and territories as drafted in 1957
- The various developments that have taken place since 1957, including Member State accessions, the addition of new territories and the departure of former territories with independence, the emergence of new groups or associations of territories, the impact of the changing political and economic setting as compared to 1957, Treaty amendments including those that resulted from the Lisbon Treaty.
- On the basis of the first two elements above, to re-examine Article 299 and the current EU Treaties framework for EU/Member State territories and to argue the case for and propose a new model Treaties framework for relations between the EU and the relevant Member State Territories.

Many people have helped me in my research for this book, to whom I extend a general heartfelt thank you. I would like to extend my particular gratitude, however, to the following: to Professor Dr. Jaap W. De Zwaan for his unfailing patience, kindness, commitment and incisive comment throughout the period of research for this book. It has been a pleasure to know and to work with you. To Associate professor Dr. Flora Goudappel, thank you for generously giving of your time and experience. To Professor Dr. Jacques Ziller for his expert and helpful comments and especially for graciously agreeing to prepare the foreword to this book. To my publishers, particularly Philip van Tongeren, Marjolijn Bastiaans and Antoinette Wessels for their kind, patient and experienced guidance in the editing of this book. To my three sons, Fionn, Oisín and Áengus who provided tireless love, inspiration and encouragement to keep me going. And, last but not least, to my husband, Barry, who has supported and encouraged me unceasingly in this project and to whom I dedicate this work. I love you and thank you.

## Reference

Murray F (2004) *EU and Member State Territories: The Special Relationship under Community Law*, Sweet & Maxwell



# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>General Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Overview	1
1.2	Current EU Treaties Framework: EU/Member State Territories	2
1.2.1	Background	2
1.2.2	Developments Since 1957	2
1.2.3	Lisbon Treaty Changes to Article 299 TEC	4
1.3	Introduction to Current EU Treaties Framework: EU/Member State Territories	5
1.3.1	Overview of Current Relevant Lisbon Treaty Provisions	5
1.3.2	Background to the Current EU Treaties Framework and Developments Since 1957	6
1.4	Scope	6
1.4.1	Territories Concerned	6
1.4.2	Territorial Scope of Treaties	8
1.5	Aims	8
1.6	Methodology	9
	References	12

## **Part I Background to Article 299 (ex Article 227) at the Time the Provision was Drafted in 1957**

<b>2</b>	<b>General Introduction to Original Art 227 TEC</b>	<b>15</b>
2.1	Introduction to Article 227 TEC (1957)	16
2.2	Pre 1957: Political and Economic Backdrop	16
2.3	Relevant Member States and Territories	17
2.4	General Aims of Article 227, 1957 TEC	18

2.5 ECSC and Euratom Treaties . . . . . 19

2.6 Conclusions . . . . . 20

**3 Article 227(1): Territorial Scope of the TEC . . . . . 23**

3.1 Introduction and Background . . . . . 23

3.2 Relevant Member States and Territories . . . . . 24

3.3 Conclusions . . . . . 24

Reference . . . . . 24

**4 Article 227(2): Algeria, French DOMS . . . . . 25**

4.1 Introduction and Background . . . . . 25

4.2 Relevant Member States and Territories . . . . . 26

4.3 Aims and Scope of Article 227(2) . . . . . 26

4.4 Conclusions . . . . . 27

Reference . . . . . 28

**5 Article 227(3): Overseas Countries and Territories (OCTs) . . . . . 29**

5.1 Introduction and Background . . . . . 29

5.2 Relevant Member States and Territories . . . . . 30

5.3 Aims and Scope of Article 227(3) . . . . . 31

5.4 Part Four (Articles 131–136), TEC 1957 . . . . . 32

5.5 Implementing Convention . . . . . 34

5.6 Conclusions . . . . . 36

References . . . . . 36

**6 Article 227(4): European Member State Territories for Whose External Relations a Member State is Responsible . . . . . 37**

6.1 Introduction and Background . . . . . 37

6.2 Relevant Member States and Territories . . . . . 38

6.3 Aims and Scope of Article 227(4) . . . . . 38

6.4 Conclusions . . . . . 39

6.5 General Conclusions to Part I . . . . . 40

Reference . . . . . 40

**Part II Article 299 and Lisbon Treaty Amendments, Comparison with 1957**

**7 General Introduction to Article 299 TEC . . . . . 43**

7.1 Introduction to Article 299 TEC . . . . . 45

7.2 Political and Economic Backdrop Today (Compared with 1957) . . . . . 45

7.3 Article 299 Compared with 1957 Original Version . . . . . 46

7.4 Conclusions . . . . . 50

<b>8</b>	<b>Article 299(1): Territorial Scope of the TEC (as Compared with 1957 Version)</b> . . . . .	51
8.1	Introduction (Comparison to 1957 Version) . . . . .	51
8.2	Relevant Member States and Territories . . . . .	52
8.2.1	Ceuta and Melilla . . . . .	52
8.3	Article 299(1): Developments Since 1957, Including Treaty Amendments . . . . .	57
8.3.1	Clarification of the Aims and Scope of Article 299(1) . . . . .	57
8.3.2	Meaning of Territory . . . . .	57
8.3.3	Application to Member State Territories . . . . .	58
8.3.4	The Two Germanys . . . . .	58
8.3.5	EU Customs Territory . . . . .	59
8.3.6	Application of Second and Third Pillars to Article 299 . . . . .	61
8.3.7	Member State Accessions . . . . .	62
8.3.8	2007: Lisbon Treaty Amendments to Article 299 in General . . . . .	64
8.3.9	2007: Lisbon Treaty Amendments to Article 299(1) Specifically . . . . .	68
8.4	Conclusions . . . . .	69
	References . . . . .	70
<b>9</b>	<b>Article 299(2): The Outermost Regions</b> . . . . .	71
9.1	Introduction (Comparison with 1957 Version) . . . . .	71
9.2	Applicable Member States and Territories: Present Day . . . . .	72
9.3	General Characteristics of Outermost Regions . . . . .	73
9.4	Overview of the Outermost Regions . . . . .	74
9.4.1	Constitutional Relations with their Member States . . . . .	75
9.5	Article 299(2): Developments Since 1957, Including Treaty Amendments . . . . .	79
9.5.1	Member State Accessions . . . . .	79
9.5.2	1960s and 1970s: Early Developments and Interpretation of Article 227(2) . . . . .	80
9.5.3	1980s: the POSEI Programmes . . . . .	81
9.5.4	1993: Maastricht Treaty . . . . .	82
9.5.5	1990s: Legros, Lancry Judgments . . . . .	83
9.5.6	1997: Amsterdam Treaty . . . . .	84
9.5.7	2000: Post Amsterdam Treaty . . . . .	85
9.5.8	2007: Lisbon Treaty Amendments to Article 299(2) . . . . .	89
9.6	Conclusions . . . . .	90
	Reference . . . . .	90

<b>10 Article 299(3): Overseas Countries and Territories</b> . . . . .	91
10.1 Introduction (Comparison with 1957 Version) . . . . .	91
10.2 Applicable Member States and Territories: Present Day . . . . .	92
10.3 General Characteristics of the OCTs . . . . .	93
10.4 Overview of the OCTs . . . . .	93
10.4.1 Constitutional Relations with Their Member State . . . . .	94
10.5 Article 299(3): Developments Since 1957, Including Treaty Amendments . . . . .	96
10.5.1 Member State Accessions and Territories . . . . .	96
10.5.2 1958: Emergence of EU/ACP Partnership . . . . .	100
10.5.3 1962 (–2001): EU/OCT Council Decisions . . . . .	105
10.5.4 1991: Council Decision 91/482/EEC . . . . .	105
10.5.5 1993: Maastricht Treaty . . . . .	106
10.5.6 1997: Council Decision 97/803/EC . . . . .	106
10.5.7 1997: Amsterdam Treaty . . . . .	106
10.5.8 2001: Council Decision 2001/822/EC . . . . .	107
10.5.9 2007: Lisbon Treaty Amendments to Article 299(3) . . . . .	107
10.5.10 June 2008: Commission Communication . . . . .	108
10.6 EU Legal Framework and Policy Governing Relations Between the OCTs and the EU . . . . .	109
10.6.1 Part Four (Articles 182–188) of the TEC 2009 . . . . .	109
10.6.2 Council Decision 2001/822/EC . . . . .	110
10.6.3 Application to OCTs of Other TEC Provisions . . . . .	112
10.6.4 Areas of EU/OCT Co-operation . . . . .	113
10.6.5 Implementation of the EU/OCT Arrangements . . . . .	115
10.6.6 EU Financial Assistance . . . . .	115
10.6.7 OCT/ACP Parallelism . . . . .	116
10.7 Conclusions . . . . .	118
References . . . . .	118
<b>11 Article 299(4): European Member State Territories for Whose External Relations a Member State is Responsible: Gibraltar</b> . . . . .	121
11.1 Introduction (Comparison with 1957 Provision) . . . . .	121
11.2 Applicable Member State Territories: Present Day . . . . .	121
11.3 Overview of Gibraltar . . . . .	122
11.3.1 Constitutional Relations with the United Kingdom . . . . .	125
11.4 Article 299(4): Developments Since 1957 in Relation to Article 299(4) . . . . .	126
11.4.1 Member State Accessions . . . . .	126
11.4.2 Impact of UK/Spanish Relations . . . . .	127

- 11.4.3 Lisbon Treaty Amendments to Article 299(4) . . . . . 129
- 11.4.4 EU Legal Framework Governing Relations Between Gibraltar and EU . . . . . 129
- 11.5 Conclusions . . . . . 130
  
- 12 Art 299(5): Aland Islands . . . . . 131**
  - 12.1 Introduction . . . . . 131
  - 12.2 Background . . . . . 132
  - 12.3 Overview of the Aland Islands . . . . . 133
    - 12.3.1 Constitutional Relations with Finland . . . . . 134
  - 12.4 Article 299(5): Developments Since Finnish Accession . . . . . 135
  - 12.5 EU Legal Framework Governing Relations Between the Aland Islands and the EU . . . . . 136
  - 12.6 Conclusions . . . . . 138
  
- 13 Art 299(6): Faroe Islands, Sovereign Base Areas in Cyprus, Channel Islands and the Isle of Man . . . . . 139**
  - 13.1 Introduction . . . . . 139
  - 13.2 Faroe Islands . . . . . 140
    - 13.2.1 Introduction and Background . . . . . 140
    - 13.2.2 Overview of the Faroe Islands . . . . . 141
    - 13.2.3 Constitutional Relations with Denmark . . . . . 143
    - 13.2.4 Developments Since Danish Accession . . . . . 144
    - 13.2.5 EU Legal Framework Governing Relations Between the Faroe Islands and the EU . . . . . 145
  - 13.3 Sovereign Base Areas of the UK in Cyprus . . . . . 147
    - 13.3.1 Introduction and Background . . . . . 147
    - 13.3.2 Overview of the SBAs . . . . . 147
    - 13.3.3 Constitutional Relations with the United Kingdom . . . . . 149
    - 13.3.4 Developments Since UK Accession . . . . . 150
  - 13.4 Channel Islands, Isle of Man . . . . . 152
    - 13.4.1 Introduction and Background . . . . . 152
    - 13.4.2 Overview of Channel Islands and Isle of Man . . . . . 153
    - 13.4.3 Constitutional Relations with the United Kingdom . . . . . 155
    - 13.4.4 EU Legal Framework Governing Relations Between the Channel Islands and the Isle of Man . . . . . 156
    - 13.4.5 Developments Since UK Accession . . . . . 158
  - 13.5 Conclusions . . . . . 159

<b>Part III Assessment of Article 299 and Lisbon Treaty Amendments as a Legal Framework for EU/Territories Relations Proposed New Model EU Treaties Framework</b>	
<b>14</b>	<b>General Introduction to Part III . . . . .</b> 163
14.1	Overview . . . . .
	163
<b>15</b>	<b>Summary of Main Changes to Article 299 TEC Since 1957 . . . . .</b> 165
15.1	Introduction . . . . .
	165
15.2	Structure of Article 299. . . . .
	165
15.3	Relevant Member States and Territories . . . . .
	166
15.4	Outermost Regions and OCTs (Article 299 (2) and (3)) . . . . .
	166
15.5	Territories for Whose External Relations a Member State is Responsible (Article 299(4)). . . . .
	168
15.6	Aland Islands and Territories not Part of the EU (Article 299(5) and (6)). . . . .
	168
<b>16</b>	<b>Adequacy of Article 299 as a Legal Framework for EU/Member State Territories Relations. . . . .</b> 169
16.1	General Introduction . . . . .
	169
16.2	Article 299(1) . . . . .
	169
16.2.1	Member State Accessions . . . . .
	170
16.3	Article 299(2) . . . . .
	174
16.3.1	Member State Accessions . . . . .
	174
16.4	Article 299(3) . . . . .
	175
16.5	Article 299(4) . . . . .
	176
16.6	Article 299(5) . . . . .
	177
16.7	Article 299(6) . . . . .
	177
16.8	Conclusions . . . . .
	178
	Reference . . . . .
	178
<b>17</b>	<b>The Lisbon Treaty and the European Constitution on Article 299: A Comparison . . . . .</b> 179
17.1	Introduction . . . . .
	179
17.2	Lisbon Treaty. . . . .
	179
17.3	European Constitution. . . . .
	181
17.4	Conclusions . . . . .
	189
<b>18</b>	<b>Proposed New Model EU Treaties Framework for Relations Between the EU and Member State Territories and Final Observations. . . . .</b> 191
18.1	Introduction . . . . .
	191
18.2	Model Article 355(1) . . . . .
	192
18.3	Model Article 355(2) . . . . .
	194

18.4	Model Article 355(3) . . . . .	196
18.5	Model Article 355(4) . . . . .	199
18.6	Final Observations . . . . .	210
	Part I: Original Version of Article 299 TEC, 1957 . . . . .	211
	Part II: Article 299 TEC and Developments Since 1957 . . . . .	211
	Part III: Proposed New Model Article 355 TFEU . . . . .	211
<b>Annexes</b>	. . . . .	213
Annex I	Lisbon Treaty Provisions Governing EU/Member State Territories . . . . .	215
Annex II	Article 227 TEC 1957 . . . . .	219
Annex III	Article 226 TEC 1957 . . . . .	221
Annex IV	Part Four (Articles 131–136) TEC 1957 . . . . .	223
Annex V	Implementing Convention on the Association of Overseas Countries and Territories of the Community 1957 . . . . .	227
Annex VI	Article 299 TEC 2009 . . . . .	233
Annex VII	Article 25 Spanish Act of Accession 1985 (Ceuta and Melilla) . . . . .	235
Annex VIII	Protocol No. 2 Spanish Act of Accession 1985 (Ceuta and Melilla) . . . . .	237
Annex IX	Joint Declaration on the Azores and Madeira, Portuguese Act of Accession 1985 . . . . .	243
Annex X	Declaration on the Outermost Regions, Maastricht Treaty 1992 . . . . .	245
Annex XI	Declaration on the Overseas Countries and Territories, Maastricht Treaty 1992 . . . . .	247
Annex XII	Declaration No. 36 on the Overseas Countries and Territories, Amsterdam Treaty 1997 . . . . .	249
Annex XIII	Part Four (Articles 182–188) TEC 2009 . . . . .	251

Annex XIV Article 28 UK Act of Accession 1972 (Gibraltar) . . . . 255

Annex XV Protocol No. 2 Finnish Act of Accession 1994  
(Aland Islands) . . . . . 257

Annex XVI Article 25(a) Danish Act of Accession 1972  
(Faroe Islands). . . . . 259

Annex XVII Protocol No. 2 Danish Act of Accession 1972  
(Faroe Islands). . . . . 261

Annex XVIII Protocol No. 3 Cyprus Act of Accession 2004  
(UK Sovereign Base Areas). . . . . 263

Annex XIX Protocol No. 10 Cyprus Act of Accession 2004  
(UK Sovereign Base Areas). . . . . 269

Annex XX Protocol No. 3 UK Act of Accession 1972  
(Channel Islands and Isle of Man) . . . . . 271

**Source Materials** . . . . . 273

Selected Bibliography. . . . . 273

Table of Treaties . . . . . 274

Table of Legislation . . . . . 276

EU Papers. . . . . 279

Table of Written Questions . . . . . 280

Table of Selected Cases . . . . . 280

**Index** . . . . . 283



# Abbreviations

ACP	African, Caribbean and Pacific States
CAP	Common Agricultural Policy
CCP	Common Commercial Policy
CCT	Common Customs Tariff
CFI	European Court of First Instance
DOMS	Départements d'outre-mer (French Overseas Departments)
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ECSC	European Coal and Steel Community
EDF	European Development Fund
EPA	European Partnership Agreements
ERDF	European Regional Development Fund
ESF	European Social Fund
EU	European Union
EUR	Euro
EURATOM	European Atomic Energy Treaty
FPA	Fisheries Partnership Agreement
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
OCTs	Overseas Countries and Territories
OJ	Official Journal
OP	Operational Programme
POSEIDOM	Programmes of options specific to the remote and insular nature of the DOMs
POSEICAN	Programmes of options specific to the remote and insular nature of the Canary Islands
POSEIMA	Programmes of options specific to the remote and insular nature of Madeira and the Azores
R&D	Research and Development
SBAs	Sovereign Base Areas of the UK in Cyprus
TCE	Treaty establishing a Constitution for Europe
TEC	Treaty on the European Community
TEU	Treaty on the European Union

TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TOMs	Territoires d'outre mer (French Overseas Territories)
VAT	Value Added Tax
UK	United Kingdom